DRAFT

Design Review Board
November 10, 2010

MINUTES OF A *REGULAR MEETING* OF THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD OF THE TOWN OF CLARKDALE HELD ON WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 10, 2010, AT 6:00 P.M. IN THE MEN'S LOUNGE OF THE CLARK MEMORIAL CLUBHOUSE, 19 N. NINTH STREET, CLARKDALE, AZ.

A **Regular Meeting** of the Design Review Board of the Town of Clarkdale was held on Wednesday, November 10, 2010, at 6:00 p.m. in the Men's Lounge of the Clark Memorial Clubhouse, 19 N. Ninth Street, Clarkdale, AZ.

BOARD MEMBERS:

Chairperson	Marsha Foutz	Present
Vice Chair	Robyn Prud'homme-Bauer	Present
Board Members	Michelle Hayman	Present
	Suzanne Lee	Present

STAFF:

Community Development Director	Sherry Bailey
GIS/Planner	Guss Espolt
Building Official	Paul Grasso

Others In Attendence: Carl Taskes-applicant, Rennie Radoccia, Carolyn Radoccia, Jeff Mikabauer-Clarkdale, Tom Evans – Clarkdale, Louise Scott – Pine Shadows/Cottonwood.

AGENDA ITEM: CALL TO ORDER: The Chairperson called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

AGENDA ITEM: ROLL CALL: The GIS/Planner called roll.

AGENDA ITEM: MINUTES: Consideration of the **Regular Meeting Minutes of October 13, 2010. Board Member Lee motioned to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of October 13, 2010. Vice Chairperson Prud'homme-Bauer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**

AGENDA ITEM: REPORTS:

Chairperson's Report: None.

Staff Report: Staff mentioned that a former Design Review Board member, Phil Falbo, may possibly be interested in serving again on the Board.

AGENDA ITEM: PUBLIC COMMENT: The public is invited to provide comments at this time on items that are not on this agenda. Action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision on a later agenda, as required by the Arizona Open Meeting Law. Each speaker is asked to limit his or her comment to FIVE minutes. **There was no public comment.**

NEW BUSINESS:

AGENDA ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING: DRB-090173 -Verizon Wireless – Carl Taskes – Cell Tower / Building request to be located on: Parcel # 400-06-016L, 891 First South Street, Clarkdale, AZ.

-OPEN Public Hearing: The Chairperson opened the public meeting.

-Staff Report:
Mr. Carl Taskes has submitted an application to the Design Review Board for approval for the proposed placement of a Verizon wireless microwave tower adjacent to the Clarkdale Fire Station and Public Works Shop.

The building is 26'W x 11'8"D x 11'3"H pre-fabricated with a pebble finish and light tan in color. There will be five 6' concrete filled pipe bollards surrounding the structure. It requires 200 amp. electrical service. There would be two 5 ton A/C units that cool the electronic equipment. There would also be a back-up diesel powered generator. It is a self-contained unit, with a 250 gallon fuel capacity. The generator would run once a day, for 30 minutes to keep the cell tower functioning properly. If the power were to go out, it would run continuously until power was restored. Next to the tower building and in the back of the Public Works Shop, there will be a 6' concrete masonry wall enclosure for gravel storage. **The proposed tower has two 8' microwave dishes, is 80' tall and has a base of 3' and tapers to 18' at the top.** (Seen in Exhibit A).

The Town of Clarkdale is in lease negotiation with Verizon to place the proposed tower at the Clarkdale Fire Station and Public Works Shop, Parcel 400-06-016L.

The Federal Communications Commission Fact Sheet will be available at the Design Review meeting. This document is information provided by the Wireless Telecommunication Bureau for the new National Wireless Tower Siting Polices.

The building is the structure that comes under the Design Review Board. The pole is an incidental structure.

Section 11-4 Review Criteria for Design Review

A. The Design Review Board shall review applications for design approval of new construction, alterations, additions, or renovations to existing buildings or structures and shall have the power to approve, conditionally approve, or disapprove all such requests. The decisions will be based on the following criteria:

1. ARCHITECTURAL MERIT: The architecture and design shall be visually
Compatible with the buildings, structures and places to which it is related.

(The site where the proposed tower is to be erected is more industrial in nature.)

2. PROPORTION: The relationship of the width of the building or structure to its height shall be visually compatible with the buildings, structures and places to which it is related or shall be maintained as original whenever feasible.

(The original proposal was for a 120' tower, the new proposal is for an 80' tower and two 8'microwave dishes.)

3. OPENINGS: The relationship of the width of the windows and doors, to the height of windows and doors in the building shall be visually compatible with buildings, structures and places to which it is related.

(The shop building is made of masonry block. The proposed tower building structure will be pre-fabricated with a pebble finish. Structure is compatible with the industrial public use of the area.)

4. PATTERN: The relationships of solids to voids in a facade of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with buildings, structures and places to which they are related.

(The proposed tower building structure will be pre-fabricated with a pebble finish. Structure is compatible with the industrial area.)

5. SPACING: The relationship of the building to the open space between it and the adjoining buildings shall be visually compatible to the buildings, structures and places to which it is related.

(The proposed tower building structure will be in the concrete parking area of the Fire Station and Public Works Shop. There will be five 6' concrete filled pipe bollards surrounding structure.)

6. ENTRANCES, PORCHES AND PROJECTIONS: The height, projection, supports and relationship to streets and sidewalks, of entrances, porches, awnings, canopies and balconies of a building shall be visually compatible to the buildings, structures and places to which it is related.

(The proposed tower building structure has no projections.)

7. MATERIAL, TEXTURE AND COLOR: The materials, textures and colors of the facade of a building shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials, textures and colors used in the buildings and structures to which they are related.

(The proposed tower building structure will be pre-fabricated with a pebble finish.)

8. ROOFS: The roof shape and materials of a building shall be visually compatible with the buildings to which it is related.

(The proposed tower building structure will be pre-fabricated with a matching metal roof.)

9. ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS: Doors, windows, eaves, cornices and other architectural details of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with buildings and structures to which they are related.

(The proposed tower building structure doors will be metal and painted to match the outer structure.)

10. ACCESSORY FEATURES: Garages, carports, sheds, enclosures, walkways, stairways, and landings shall be visually compatible with buildings and structures to which they are related.

(Next to the tower building and back of the Public Works Shop there will be a 6' concrete masonry wall enclosure for gravel storage.)

11. LANDSCAPING: Landscaping shall be visually compatible with the landscaping around the buildings, structures and places to which it is related.

(There is no landscaping intended for this area, parking only.)

12. LIGHTING: Any on-site illumination shall be architecturally compatible to the overall project and not create a negative or visually detrimental effect on the building or neighboring properties.

> ***(No exterior lighting shows on the submitted plans. Staff has recommended a condition that security lights must meet the night sky lighting code requirements: Be hooded, directed downward, not spill over outside of the immediate area, be motion sensitive if possible.)***

Issues to be addressed:

1. Adding security fencing around the monopole.

Staff Comments:

Staff recommends the proposed Verizon tower and building structure be approved with the following stipulations.

1. Security lights must meet the night sky lighting code requirements: Be hooded, directed downward, not spill over outside of the immediate area, be motion sensitive if possible.

2. The scheduling of the half-hour weekly generator run needs to be coordinated with the Fire Department.

3. Adding security fencing around the monopole.

-Applicant Presentation:
Mr. Carl Taskes –3116 S. Mill Ave., Tempe, AZ., stated the following:
-There would be lights at the entrance door for illumination.
-The generator would run once weekly for 30 minutes to be coordinated with the Fire District.
-Fencing if required, but not really necessary, would need a gate.
-Last year's meeting regarding this request was mentioned and how the location for the request has since changed. Mr. Taskes mentioned re-doing aggregate bins for Public Works and the Fire District. Also mentioned were the ice shields for dishes being necessary.

-Invite Public to Speak:
The following people addressed the Design Review Board with the following areas of concerns:

Rennie Radoccia-Clarkdale, Carolyn Radoccia, Jeff Mikabauer-Clarkdale, Tom Evans – Clarkdale, Louise Scott – Pine Shadows/Cottonwood.

-Installation issues / lack of site plan
-The tower does not belong in Historic Districts
-Design Review Board should re-think the process being used
-Tower height of 80'
-Is Federal approval needed?
-Possible health effects
-Disagreed with the way the Staff Report addressed the tower and the equipment building

-CLOSE Public Hearing: The Chairperson closed the public meeting.

AGENDA ITEM: CONSIDERATION & POSSIBLE ACTION: DRB-090173-Verizon Wireless – Carl Taskes – Cell Tower / Building request to be located on: Parcel # 400-06-016L, 891 First South Street, Clarkdale, AZ.

-Questions may be directed to staff / applicant:
The following are responses from Staff or applicant.

-The Town Council will review the Tower/Building together in the consideration of the lease.
-The applicant explained the location choice, the 2 dishes and the possibility for expansion.
-Line-of-sight was the reason given for location. This site was chosen for the Town to install Fire, Police and other antennas.
-There would be approximately 50 db. noise level.
-The A/C would run as necessary.
-The area should be acknowledged as "Historic" vs., industrial use on the staff report.
-Using a disguise such as a palm tree, pine tree, etc., like other municipalities have done, can possibly be explored.
-The Chairperson asked the applicant if the 80' maximum would be a deal breaker. The applicant stated that 60-65' would be the minimum height Verizon would be able to use.
-Any height change would be subject to review.
-The applicant stated there are other options that could be looked at for better asthetics.

-Discussion:
-The FCC rules indicate Towns and Cities must allow heights the engineers specify.
-The Board Members would like to see some type of model built along with a perspective of height.
-A balloon test was mentioned regarding the height factor.
-The Board would like the applicant to check with their engineers to see if any other sites are a possibility.
-The Board asked what are the Historic District Standards?

-The Community Development Director stated there are no Historic District standards, only Commercial District standards. Historically, Clarkdale did not want Historic standards. The Tower height limit is 50' in the Commercial District. The Town Council can approve any height on this particular property because it is public property not subject to zoning restrictions.

-The Board Members feel public and their comments should be brought to the Council. The Design Review Board guidelines are limited and there is no cell tower ordinance. The Historic District guidelines are non-existent.

-ACTION: The Board Members tabled DRB-090173-Verizon Wireless–Carl Taskes – Cell Tower / Building request to be located on: Parcel # 400-06-016L, 891 First South Street, Clarkdale, AZ., to their regular December 8, 2010 meeting. There were no actions taken on this agenda item.

AGENDA ITEM: FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:

-The 10-12 Lounge will be coming to the Design Review Board with a monument sign concept that fits the 89-A criteria in December.
-Verizon Wireless – Cell Tower / Building request in December.

AGENDA ITEM: ADJOURNMENT: Chairperson Foutz motioned to adjourn the meeting. Vice Chairperson Prud'homme-Bauer seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

APPROVED BY:

Marsha Foutz
Chairperson

SUBMITTED BY:

Guss Espolt
GIS/Planner