

**PLANNING
COMMISSION
AUGUST 18, 2015**

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE TOWN OF CLARKDALE HELD ON TUESDAY, AUGUST 18, 2015, IN THE MEN'S LOUNGE OF THE CLARK MEMORIAL CLUBHOUSE, 19 N. NINTH STREET, CLARKDALE, AZ.

A Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission of the Town of Clarkdale was held on Tuesday, August 18, 2015, at 4:00 p.m., in the Men's Lounge of the Clark Memorial Clubhouse, 19 N. Ninth Street, Clarkdale, AZ.

Planning Commission:

Vice Chairperson	Ida-Meri deBlanc	Present
Commissioners	Jorge Olguin	Present
	John Erickson	Present
	Craig Backus	Present

Staff:

Community Development Director Jodie Filardo

Others in Attendance: Joseph Rongo, Jamie Rongo, Gary Clouston, Steve Biasini, Krishan Ginige, Charlie Toy, Drake Meinke, Stephanie Haggart, Mike Knox, Novie Trump, Joanne Lindsey, Phil Terbell, Roy Valdivia, Robert Haggart

1. **AGENDA ITEM: CALL TO ORDER:** Vice Chair de Blanc called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.
2. **AGENDA ITEM: ROLL CALL:** Director Filardo called the roll.
3. **AGENDA ITEM: PUBLIC COMMENT:** The public is invited to provide comments at this time on items that are not on this agenda. Action taken as a result of public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision on a later agenda, as required by the Arizona Open Meeting Law. Each speaker is asked to limit his or her comments to FIVE MINUTES.

There was no public comment.
4. **AGENDA ITEM: MINUTES:** Consideration of the **Regular Meeting Minutes of June 16, 2015**. The Vice Chair entertained a motion to accept the minutes. Commissioner Erickson motioned to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of June 16, 2015. Commissioner Olguin seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.
5. **AGENDA ITEM: REPORTS:**
 - a. **Chairperson and Members Report** – Commissioner Erickson noted the striped parking spaces and the cleanup of parking spaces around the Clarkdale Historical Society and Museum in keeping with the Planning Commission's review of parking in upper Clarkdale. Further, he noted the cleanup and the new displays in the windows of the building at Ninth

and Main and thanked the Clarkdale Downtown Business Alliance for their beautification of the corner.

b. Director's Report

1. July 2015 Statistics.



2. Permits Issued – Includes permits from June/July – 17 total.

- Equipment shelter and electrical service at 1450 SR 89A
- Fence at 1175 Valley View Road
- Photovoltaic solar electric at 450 E. Raven Hill Road
- Bath remodel at 2181 Liough Drive
- Gas line repair at 501 Lincoln Drive
- Accessory structure at 1000 Calle Rosas
- Re-roof at 1080 Old Jerome Highway
- Remodel (Clarkdale Hotel at Town Park) at 921 Main Street
- Accessory building at 2140 Windy Street
- Greenhouse & two storage building additions at Mountain Road
- Fence permit at 1880 Moonlight Drive
- Photovoltaic solar permit at 75 Copper Street



Repair of gas line at 500 Todd Circle
Photovoltaic solar electric at 811 Cassandra Court
Electrical panel upgrade at 811 Cassandra Court
Photovoltaic solar electric at 2627 Haskell Springs Road
Accessory structure at 581 Sky Drive

3. **Dog Days of Summer - June 20th.** Despite the extraordinarily hot weather, about 26 dogs and their people turned out for the event and fun was had by all.
4. **Verde Valley Open Air Cinema in Town Park - Casablanca** on the lawn of Town Park on June 20th. With the best turnout for the series, approximately 200 folks enjoyed Casablanca outside under a balmy night sky for the finale of this year's Verde Valley Open Air Cinema, brought to Clarkdale via an "art tank" grant from Arizona Commission on the Arts.
5. **Check out the windows.** With thanks to Robyn Prud'homme-Bauer, Cindy Emmett, Janice Benatz, and David Baird, the windows at Maury Herman's building were cleaned for the first time in MANY years. Armed with razor blades, ladders, window washing gear from Paul Grasso, plus vinegar and water, the clean windows breathed life back into the building. Then the Clarkdale Downtown Business Alliance with expert help from Barbara Schlenoff, a former buyer from Bloomingdale's who now lives in the Verde Valley, the windows were dressed to impress while showcasing all sorts of things to see, do, and buy here in Clarkdale. Before the job was even complete, folks were seen taking a video of the new windows, and many slowed down and even stopped to check out what was happening. It's amazing what the Clarkdale Downtown Business Alliance can do!



6. August 5th- 7th – Arizona Rural Policy Forum.

During the week of August 5th, Clarkdale turned out to host 200 economic developers at the Clark Memorial Clubhouse for this year's Forum. Created by the Arizona Rural Development Council led by Kimber Lanning, the event brings folks from all over rural Arizona together to discuss an array of topics from sustainability to value chain mapping to funding and beyond. Kicked off by a Verde Canyon Railroad train ride, the participants then transitioned to the Welcome Reception hosted at the Arizona Copper Art

Museum with help from the Town, Made in Clarkdale, and the Clarkdale Downtown Business Alliance who served as Clarkdale Ambassadors. About 100 folks attended an evening of copper, music by the Buzzard Brothers featuring Chris Livas, and scrumptious food from Main Street Cafe & Pizzeria, Su Casa, Violette's Fine Pastries, local plums from Bent River Ranch, plus cheeses supplied by Drake Meinke. In addition, Four Eight Wineworks poured their red and white wines and THAT beer. Décor was created, donated and installed by Juliana Brutsche of the Verde Valley Arts Council. A 50/50 raffle added more fun to the evening and was won by a visitor from Sierra Vista with the other proceeds repaying Made In Clarkdale for pulling an event liquor license and insurance. A great time was had by all.

The Forum itself started when Mayor Von Gausig welcomed everyone to the Forum, and lectured on the economics of the Verde River. About 48 experts participated in lectures and round-table discussions throughout the two-day event. In addition to the Mayor participating, Councilor Regner and several Town staff members were able to attend various lectures.



Food for the event was provided by local restaurants in keeping with Local First Arizona's principles; Su Casa, Nate's Cowboy Cafe, and Crema all provided meals. In addition, Thursday's evening event was a night at the Blazin' M which provided fun for all.

Staff heard many compliments from attendees about the welcome they'd received from Clarkdale, the beauty of Clarkdale and the Clubhouse, and folks often shared they'd never been here before but planned to return soon. Thus far, everything seemed to be a big success.

7. **United Verde Soil Project.** On August 11th, Council approved an array of recommended updates to both the Sampling Analysis Plan and the Quality Assurance Project Plan currently open for public comment by the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality. A core team of staff members continues to participate in the review of all related documents to maximize options and support for residents and the Town alike.

6. **NEW BUSINESS:**

- a. **PUBLIC HEARING:** Regarding a Conditional Use Permit Application for a medical treatment facility at the Sedona Wellness-School of Ayurveda Massage (formerly known as the ASIS Massage School) to allow for certified professionals to provide massage, health and wellness advice within the existing facility. Assessor's Parcel

Number 400-07-026F. Address 414¹ Peace Garden Path (formally 701 South Broadway). The property is approximately 5.37 acres and zoned R2-Single family & Limited Multi Family Residential.

• **Staff Report:**

Background:

Mr. Joseph Rongo has managed the ASIS Massage School located on the subject property since its construction in 2000. The school operates under a conditional use permit (CUP) granted in 1999. The school has recently undergone a name change to Sedona Wellness-School of Ayurveda Massage.

The school continues to operate within the parameters of the granted CUP. Students at the facility provide massage services to outside clients as part of their training curriculum.

Mr. Rongo is requesting a second conditional use permit to allow teachers, alumni and professional therapists to provide massage and wellness services to clients at the facility.

Zoning and Vicinity

The subject property is zoned R2 – Single Family and Limited Multiple Family Residential. Per Section 3-4.C4 of the Zoning Code, hospitals are a conditional use in this zoning district. It is staff's determination that the proposed health and wellness treatments meets the broadest definition of a hospital as a facility where sick or injured people are given medical treatment.

The property is accessed off of Broadway Street, an arterial road as designated in the 2012 Clarkdale General Plan.

Property to the north of the subject parcel is zoned R2 (Single Family and Limited Multiple Family Residential). Property across Broadway is zoned R1 (Single Family Residential).

The subject property is designated as 'Neighborhood Commercial' in the 2012 Clarkdale General Plan. Neighborhood Commercial is defined as commercial retail and services providing surrounding neighborhoods and residents of Clarkdale with their basic day-to-day needs.

The property already contains an approximately 3,500 square-foot building. No additional construction is proposed related to this CUP request.

Application

The request is to allow medical professionals to provide health and wellness services to customers at the existing massage facility.

Internal Agency Review

¹ Applicant Joseph Rongo noted that the address of parcel 400-07-026F was incorrectly stated in the Staff Report. The correct address is 414 Peace Garden Path and these Minutes have been updated to reflect the correct address.

The application was sent to the Public Works Department, Police Department and Yavapai County Health Department for review.

No objections were filed regarding this application.

Outside Agency Review

Yavapai County Health Department responded they had no concerns with this application.

The Clarkdale Fire District will treat this as a business occupancy. There are no additional requirements for this type of occupancy.

Public participation

The applicant sent a letter regarding the proposed expansion of services to all property owners within 1,000 feet.

Public Notices were sent to 34 property owners and the property was posted on July 31st. A public notice was published in the Verde Independent on August 2, 2015.

Analysis

Town Regulations

Per Section 5-5 of the Town Zoning Code, the Planning Commission shall make findings on a conditional use permit application based on the following six elements:

1. **Applicable Regulations:** Those conditions necessary to assure compatibility of the development of the land in question will be consistent with the purpose of the Zoning Ordinance, Town of Clarkdale General Plan, other statute, and any ordinance or policies that may be applicable.

Staff Analysis – The proposed use is allowed in the Commercial District with a conditional use permit. The existing facility has operated at this location for over ten years without any issues.

2. **Bulk Regulations:** The site is adequate in size and topography to accommodate proposed use, population density, building height, lot coverage, setbacks, spaces, landscaping, fences and parking. That these elements are compatible with the general character of development in the vicinity of the proposed conditional use and are adequate to properly relate the proposed use with the existing land uses in the vicinity.

Staff Analysis – There will be no changes to the previously approved site or building related to this CUP request.

3. **Performance:** That the location, design and operation characteristics of the proposed use are such that it will have minimal adverse impact on the livability, public health, safety, welfare,

or convenience of persons residing or working in the vicinity, to adjacent property, to the neighborhood or to the public welfare in general in that the facility, once completed should not interfere with the day-to-day operations of the existing businesses.

Staff Analysis – Per the applicant’s letter of intent, a large increase of customers as a result of the new services being offered is not anticipated. Student enrollment in the massage school has dropped off, and the applicant hopes the new services being offered would help counter this decrease. Estimated occupancy during hours of operation is 8-26 people, including staff and customers. The maximum number reflects occupancy when school is in session. Hours of operation are 8:30 a.m. to 7:00 p.m., seven days a week. On-site parking is adequate to accommodate the maximum occupancy.

4. **Traffic Impacts:** The provisions for ingress and egress, public streets and traffic circulation are adequate, or can be upgraded through street improvements as a condition of approval.

Staff Analysis – No increase in traffic to the site is anticipated.

5. **Landscaping:** Landscaping, and/or fencing of the proposed development, assures that the site development will be compatible with adjoining area and with the intent of Town policies.

Staff Analysis – Landscaping is already in place.

6. **Nuisance:** That the proposed use will not create a hazard to persons and property from possible explosion, contamination, fire or flood. That the use will not create a nuisance arising from, but not limited to noise, smoke, odors, dust, vibrations, signage or illumination.

Staff Analysis – The proposed expansion of existing services does not create a hazard or nuisance.

Summary: In staff’s opinion, and with the recommended conditions, the application is in compliance with the required findings for a Conditional Use Permit.

Future Expansion

Any expansion of the services proposed under this CUP request would require an additional hearing process. Any expansion proposing additional construction on the site would require design and site plan review in addition to CUP approval.

Recommendation:

Staff has determined the Conditional Use Permit application to be complete and in compliance with the requirements of Section 5-6 of the Town of Clarkdale Zoning Code.

If the Planning Commission chooses to recommend approval of the Conditional Use Permit application, staff offers the following conditions:

1. Services provided shall be limited to those described in the Letter of Intent dated 7/14/15.
2. No additional construction shall be associated with this Conditional Use Permit.

End of Staff Report

• **Questions to Staff:**

Commissioner Erickson indicated he had toured the property and felt there were no problems with ingress or egress relative to the property. Commissioner Backus inquired as to what happens if the new business is more successful than expected and resulted in more people on the property. Director Filardo indicated the Commission could stipulate a limit to the total number of people on the property if that is a concern. Applicant Joseph Rongo indicated he would need to make building modifications in order to accommodate more people than the numbers presented with this CUP, and would therefore be pulling a building permit.

- **Open Public Hearing:** Vice Chair deBlanc opened the Public Hearing. There were no members of the public who spoke on this item.
- **Close Public Hearing:** Vice Chair deBlanc closed the Public Hearing.

- b. **CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION:** Discussion/possible action regarding a Conditional Use Permit Application for a medical treatment facility at the Sedona Wellness-School of Ayurveda Massage (formerly known as the ASIS Massage School) to allow for certified professionals to provide massage, health and wellness advice within the existing facility. Assessor's Parcel Number 400-07-026F. Address 501 Peace Garden Path (formally 701 South Broadway). The property is approximately 5.37 acres and zoned R2-Single family & Limited Multi Family Residential.

ACTION: Commissioner Olguin motioned to recommend approval of the conditional use permit application for the Sedona Wellness-School of Ayurveda Massage based on staff's opinion of the compliance of the application with the elements of Applicable Regulations, Bulk Regulations, Performance, Traffic Impacts, Landscaping, and Nuisance and including the following conditions:

1. Services provided shall be limited to those described in the Letter of Intent dated 7/14/15 and
2. No additional construction shall be associated with this Conditional Use Permit.

Commissioner Backus seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS continued:

- c. **PUBLIC HEARING:** Regarding a Conditional Use Permit Application for a RV Park with a maximum of 70 spaces and supporting infrastructure, including a pool, locker rooms, office, shop and the placement of a mobile home to house the applicant on site. Assessor's parcel number is 400-07-005. Address: 551 S. Broadway. The subject property is approximately 9.75 acres and is zoned commercial.
- **Staff Report:**

Background:

Applicant Gary Clouston is requesting a conditional use permit for a recreational vehicle (RV) park at 551 S. Broadway Street. This property has been previously developed for the Verde Valley Christian Church. Water, wastewater and electrical infrastructure is in place with grading of a portion of the site and installation of utility infrastructure. The applicant is proposing to limit development to this previously disturbed area.

Zoning and Vicinity

The subject property is zoned Commercial (C). Per Section 3-11.C.3 of the Zoning Code, campsites and recreational vehicle parks are listed as a conditional use.

The property is accessed off of Broadway Street, an arterial road as designated in the 2012 Clarkdale General Plan.

The property to the north of the subject parcel is zoned Commercial. Property to the south is zoned R2 (Single Family and Limited Multiple Family Residential). Property across Broadway is zoned R1 (Single Family Residential).

The subject property is designated as 'Neighborhood Commercial' in the 2012 Clarkdale General Plan. Neighborhood Commercial is defined as commercial retail and services providing surrounding neighborhoods and residents of Clarkdale with their basic day-to-day needs.

Application

Mr. Clouston is proposing a RV park with a maximum of 70 rental spaces. The proposed park will use only the area already disturbed on the site. Rental spaces will be flexible to accommodate longer vehicles and shorter vehicles.

A 20-foot wide travel aisle will provide access throughout the RV Park. Additional parking for cars is incorporated into the shoulders of these travel aisles.

Four buildings are proposed to be constructed on the site: a combination laundry/6 bathrooms with showers, an office, a recreation room and a maintenance shop. A pool is also proposed. Buildings will have a southwest design.

Each individual RV slot will have a connection to Town water and wastewater.

The existing chain link fence will be removed.

A stucco wall is proposed for the entrance along Broadway.

Mr. Clouston is requesting to place a manufactured home at the northeast corner of the developed area as a residence for him and his family.

Internal Agency Review

The application was sent to the Public Works Department and Police Department for review.

Outside Agency Review

Review and permitting for any food market or food service and the semi-public pool will be required through the Yavapai County Health Department.

As a result of comments from the Fire District, the applicant will be installing a fire hydrant at the north end of the back row of RV slots. There is an existing fire hydrant in the right-of-way directly in front of the subject property. The second hydrant was requested to allow for the evacuation of the site in case of a wildland fire in the undeveloped area between the site and the Verde River.

Public Participation

The applicant held a neighborhood meeting on July 10, 2015. Six property owners attended this meeting. Concerns were expressed regarding the visible impact to residents whose homes are located at a higher elevation than the project and about water use for the park. The neighbors also wanted to know about length of stay restrictions and whether tents would be allowed.

Public notices were sent to 23 property owners within 1,000 feet. The property was posted on July 31, 2015 and the notice appeared in the paper on August 2, 2015.

Design Review and Site Plan Review

Per Section 11-1 of the Zoning Code, design review and site plan review is required for all new commercial development. This hearing will be scheduled if the application receives approval of the conditional use permit.

Analysis

Town Regulations

Per Section 5-5 of the Town Zoning Code, the Planning Commission shall make findings on a conditional use permit application based on the following six elements:

7. **Applicable Regulations:** Those conditions necessary to assure compatibility of the development of the land in question will be consistent with the purpose of the Zoning Ordinance, Town of Clarkdale General Plan, other statute, and any ordinance or policies that may be applicable.

Staff Analysis – The proposed use is allowed in the Commercial District with a conditional use permit.

Advancing tourism opportunities is an identified goal of the 2013 Sustainable Community and Economic Development Plan.

- 8. Bulk Regulations:** The site is adequate in size and topography to accommodate proposed use, population density, building height, lot coverage, setbacks, spaces, landscaping, fences and parking. That these elements are compatible with the general character of development in the vicinity of the proposed conditional use and are adequate to properly relate the proposed use with the existing land uses in the vicinity.

Staff Analysis – The 9.75-acre site is adequate to accommodate the proposed use. The proposed development will leave approximately 4 acres on the property untouched. The proposed site design of the project complies with setback requirements for the Commercial District.

- 9. Performance:** That the location, design and operation characteristics of the proposed use are such that it will have minimal adverse impact on the livability, public health, safety, welfare, or convenience of persons residing or working in the vicinity, to adjacent property, to the neighborhood or to the public welfare in general in that the facility, once completed should not interfere with the day-to-day operations of the existing businesses.

Staff Analysis – The project does not present a health or safety issue to the surrounding neighborhood.

- 10. Traffic Impacts:** The provisions for ingress and egress, public streets and traffic circulation are adequate, or can be upgraded through street improvements as a condition of approval.

Staff Analysis – The applicant's engineer has provided an analysis of the traffic impact of this project. Per this investigation, the sight distances from both directions of travel are clear enough that a right-turn lane or a center turn lane are not warranted by the estimated traffic generated by the development.

The applicant's engineer is recommending that exiting from the park for RVs be limited to a right turn only. The site distance for a left hand turn is adequate based on the existed posted speed limit of 45 mph. However, calculating the site distance requirements based on an estimated speed of 55 mph, the site distance is determined to be not adequate. This restriction will be enforced through signage and also included in the rental agreement. Cars would be permitted to turn left when exiting the park.

- 11. Landscaping:** Landscaping, and/or fencing of the proposed development, assures that the site development will be compatible with adjoining area and with the intent of Town policies.

Staff Analysis – A draft landscaping plan has been included with the application. Because of the concerns of neighbors who are looking down on the project, the landscape plan includes a large number of evergreen trees along the property boundary facing Broadway and along the eastern edge of the development which is closest to existing residences. Arizona Cypress and Ash trees are proposed to place at each RV slot to provide a screening and shade.

Staff would note any principal permitted use in the commercial district, such as the previously proposed church or a large retail store or motel, would have the same visible impact. In this case neighbors would be looking down on the roof and associated HVAC and electrical equipment.

If the conditional use permit is granted, the landscape plan, along with the building design and sign package, will be reviewed by the Design Review Board (DRB) in a public meeting. The Texas Sage listed on the preliminary landscape plan is not on the Clarkdale Plant List and will need to be replaced prior to DRB review.

Staff is suggesting a condition of approval requiring the applicant to incorporate a rainwater harvesting/gray water system on-site to provide water for the landscaping.

- 12. Nuisance:** That the proposed use will not create a hazard to persons and property from possible explosion, contamination, fire or flood. That the use will not create a nuisance arising from, but not limited to noise, smoke, odors, dust, vibrations, signage or illumination.

Staff Analysis – In staff's opinion, the proposed development does not create a hazard. As stated in the Letter of Intent, Mr. Clouston and his family plan to live on the site and will provide 24-hour monitoring of the activity and safety of the site.

Lighting on the site will be minimal. All lighting will be fully shielded and comply with Chapter Eight of the Zoning Code. A lighting plan, including cut sheets of proposed lighting, will be required during the design review.

Summary: In staff's opinion, and with the recommended conditions, the application is in compliance with the required findings for a Conditional Use Permit.

Recommendation:

Staff has determined the Conditional Use Permit application to be complete and in compliance with the requirements of Section 4-18 of the Town of Clarkdale Zoning Code.

Staff is requesting the Planning Commission conduct the public hearing regarding this application and either direct staff and/or the applicant to provide specific additional information or make a recommendation to Town Council for approval, approval with conditions, or denial of the application.

If the Planning Commission chooses to recommend approval of the Conditional Use Permit application, staff offers the following conditions:

1. A building permit shall be issued prior to construction of the buildings included in the proposal.
2. Prior to issuance of a building permit, applicant will record deeds and restrictions for this project which include prohibition against tents and camping, additions of canopies or shade structures to RV units, limiting length of stay and restricting noise after 10:00 p.m.
3. Prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy, signage restricting RV exiting out of the park to right-turn only shall be installed.
4. All lighting shall be fully shielded and meet the requirements of Section Eight of the Zoning Code.
5. The applicant shall incorporate a rainwater harvesting plan and a greywater use plan into the final landscape plan.
6. The 4-inch fire hydrant shall be installed as shown on the site plan dated 7-31-15 prior to the issuance of a certificate of occupancy.

End of Staff Report

• Presentation by applicant

Additional project clarifications were presented by Steve Biasini on behalf of the applicant as follows:

- There will be no additional ground disturbance on the property beyond the borders of the area previously disturbed.
 - Significant screening and enhancements to the landscaping were added to the project to address feedback heard from those present at the public meeting held by the applicant.
 - Texas sage will be removed from the plant list prior to the presentation to the Design Review Board should the conditional use permit be approved.
 - Quiet time is currently planned to be from 10 PM to 8 AM daily.
 - Traffic concerns were addressed through the traffic analysis provided by the project's engineer.
 - All lighting will be either bollards or ground-directed building lighting. All lighting will be shielded.
 - Swimming pools are a fairly standard amenity at RV parks.
 - Owners will be living onsite and will be managing the property.
-
- **Questions to Staff:** Commissioner Erickson wondered whether the main entrance will continue to be where the gate is currently located and also whether there will be any empty space created on the side of the gate. He also wondered what the timeline would be for

starting the project. Mr. Biasini indicated no additional ground disturbance would occur so there would not be any additional open space on the side of the gate. Mr. Clouston, the applicant, indicated the project would start as soon as they can.

Commissioner Olguin inquired about how the RVs will be forced to make a right-hand turn. Director Filardo responded that applicant had indicated signage would be installed. Mr. Biasini indicated they could install a pork chop to force the right-hand turn, but that would also prevent cars from turning left. Commissioner Olguin then suggested perhaps two different exit lanes could be created: one for use by cars only to allow left turns out of the park and the other allowing right turns for use by RVs and cars alike.

Vice Chair deBlanc voiced concerns over traffic volumes experienced due to train traffic and a thought that perhaps all traffic should be required to turn right when leaving the park. Mr. Biasini raised a concern about a forced right-hand turn causing RV drivers to choose to make challenging U-turns to be able to head back into Cottonwood. Commissioner Backus asked where the RV drivers might be able to turn around and indicated this may cause other problems. Mr. Krishan Ginige, project engineer for the applicant indicated speed of travel for existing traffic versus site distance is the issue and there is insufficient distance to permit safe left-hand turns for RVs. Director Filardo cautioned the Commission to remember the project engineer is making these recommendations based on proven standards.

Vice Chair deBlanc inquired about noise impacts. Mr. Biasini indicated that no generators will be permitted at that 10 PM as the beginning of quiet time in the park is standard throughout the RV community.

- **Open Public Hearing:** Vice Chair deBlanc opened the Public Hearing. Twelve members of the public spoke on the subject and one email was read to the audience at the request of Donna Whitmore, Clarkdale resident who could not attend the meeting. Summaries of the comments, observations and recommendations are included below and are not presented as verbatim comments.
 1. **Jamie Rongo, 501 Peace Garden Path, Clarkdale.**
 - a. Her home is this project's closest neighbor and her bedroom and bathroom and on the side of her home closest to the project.
 - b. Her home actually looks up to the property.
 - c. She seeks protection from RV visitors having views into her bedroom and bathroom.
 - d. She seeks protection for the ravine on the northeast corner of the project as this is a wildlife corridor. Further, she doesn't want RV visitors trespassing across her property in attempts to get down to the Verde River.
 - e. As she values dark skies available to her now, she wants the darkness maintained and wants consideration of the fact that downward facing lights from the project may actually shine down onto her home.
 - f. She is happy with the "no generators" rules.
 - g. She prefers that quiet time start at 9 PM.

- h. She noted this is a 24/7 business as opposed to the church which may have been expected to yield a reduced neighborhood impact having people and traffic on Wednesday nights and all day on Sundays only.
2. **Charlie Toy**, Palisades resident, Clarkdale.
- a. He is concerned about the impact of additional traffic from this project impacting his ability to leave the Palisades subdivision. He is also concerned there is only one ingress/egress point for this project.
 - b. He considers this project to be an eyesore.
 - c. He would prefer a church view, not an RV park view.
3. **Drake Meinke**, Clarkdale. Mr. Meinke offered the following comments:
- a. He would prefer not to look at a mobile or manufactured home as it might not be good to look at. He wondered whether the façade could be upgraded and shingles could be installed on the roof.
 - b. He suggested left-hand turns from the project could be restricted only during certain times of the day.
4. **Stephanie Haggart**, Palisades resident, Clarkdale.
- a. Mrs. Haggart questioned what laws applied for RV parks and wondered if Clarkdale has regulations on spacing for RV parking.
 - b. She was also concerned about the demand for water by the project.
 - c. She asked whether other Town of Clarkdale departments approved the project. Director Filardo mentioned that the department in charge of the Town's water resource reviewed the project and did not file any objections. Further, the project will be supported by the Town's water utility, not by well water.
5. **Mike Knox**, 725 Palisades, Clarkdale.
- a. Mr. Knox is concerned about the possibility of additional noise at night.
 - b. He is worried about the degradation of his view. He bought his property for the view of Tuzigoot and doesn't want that impacted.
 - c. He prefers a church on that property to the proposed RV park.
 - d. He wasn't contacted about the project and wants to be able to voice his opinion. Director Filardo interjected that he would have an additional opportunity to do so should the project move forward.
6. **Novie Trump**, Peace Garden Path, Clarkdale.
- a. Ms. Trump voiced deep concerns regarding the artist's rendering of the park project indicating it was "too loosely presented".
 - b. She wants to see the landscaping plan.
 - c. She treasures darkness in the neighborhood and is concerned about this project's impact.
 - d. She wants wildlife around the property to be protected.
 - e. She doesn't want RV visitors to trespass across her property in attempts to reach the river.
7. **Joanne Lindsay**, Palisades resident, Clarkdale.

- a. Ms. Lindsey did not want to pay for infrastructure on the project property. Director Filardo indicated the infrastructure on property is the obligation of the applicant.
 - b. In addition, Ms. Lindsey noted concerns regarding depreciation of her property value.
8. **Phil Terbell, Clarkdale.**
- a. Mr. Terbell spoke in favor of the project as there are few available overnight parking spaces for RVs in the Verde Valley.
 - b. He believes the project will benefit Clarkdale's economy.
 - c. He supports the well-designed plan.
 - d. He believes the impact of the project on the surrounding neighbors will be more moderate than other permitted commercial uses such as a dollar store.
 - e. He indicated that pools usually have a closing time in RV parks and so noise from the pool area should be minimal.
 - f. He suggested the "direct" route to 89A should be signed so that rigs leaving the project will be able to get out to 89A without driving through Cottonwood's Old Town area which is difficult in a big rig.
9. **Joseph Rongo, 505 Peace Garden Path, Clarkdale.**
- a. He mentioned having feet in both camps.
 - b. The area is beautiful and he wants to guarantee it will stay that way.
 - c. He suggested that the owner's home on the property not be permitted to be a mobile home, but perhaps be required to be a stick-built home instead. Vice Chair deBlanc requested we define mobile, modular, trailers and RVs so everyone can understand the differences.

10. **Donna Whitmore, Clarkdale.** Donna Whitmore's email was read into the record by Director Filardo as follows:

"I will not be able to attend the P&Z meetings today re this application and would appreciate it if you or someone on staff could read the following into the record on my behalf.

I have seen the plans for the Rain Spirit RV Resort and find it to be an attractive addition to the Town that should see a lot of traffic. My only concern is the pool. While I understand the Town has no restriction on pools, it most certainly has put heavy, but warranted, restrictions on outdoor water use. I am in full agreement with water use restrictions and conservation of water; allowing a pool in this facility is contradictory to those restrictions and the hope of keeping everyone 'on board' with water conservation. Should folks staying at the resort desire to swim or participate in other water activities, the Verde River is available to them a short distance away. Use of the River facilities is varied and also provides revenue to the Town.

In reading about water evaporation, I found the following: in general, a pool kept at 82F where night air drops to 70F will lose 1/2 to 1" of water per week; pool water kept at higher temperatures evaporates faster. The amount of evaporation GREATLY accelerates with wind, and Northern Arizona has a lot of wind. A 5 mph wind results in roughly 3xs the 1/2 to 1" rate of evaporation. There is also a lot of water splashed from a

pool, which adds to the water loss. If the Resort pool will be heated in winter months, the evaporation rate will remain high throughout the winter.

Other variables that impact the rate of evaporation are the surface area of a pool; the outdoor temperature; and relative humidity. Since the pool dimensions are not available on the site plan, I compared the size of the pool to the shop, which measures 48' x 28'; the pool looks to be about twice that size, at least in length.

In keeping with Clarkdale's philosophy regarding the outdoor use of water, and since there is no restriction by the Town on pools, I would ask the owners to do the right thing, join the rest of the citizens in our water conservation efforts and forego a pool in the facility.

Thank you. Donna Whitmore, Clarkdale”

11. Gary Clouston, Applicant and presently a resident of California.

- a. He has always lived on large acreage, and doesn't intend to let people go down to the river.
- b. He wants to keep the property as “country” as possible.
- c. He is “for the land”, and pointed out the parcel is already zoned commercial. If a store were to be built on the property, the hours may not be restricted.
- d. He likes dark skies, and lives as the local people around this property also wish to live.

12. Roy Valdivia, Palisades subdivision, Clarkdale

- a. He questioned the impact of 70 units versus a church on the Town's water supply.
- b. He was also concerned about the length of stay of each visitor to the property.

13. Robert Haggart, Palisades subdivision, Clarkdale

- a. Mr. Haggart noted there are differences on impact between this project and a church such as land values, water use, aesthetics, existing terrain, and views. One is in “stark contrast” to the other.
- b. He does not believe this project is a positive project.
- c. He also cited environmental impacts and the installation of a pool as “absurd”.
- d. Mr. Haggart questioned how oversight of generator would be handled and many of them are now inboard generators.
- e. Traffic also concerned him for the impacts the project poses on residents of the Palisades. Also there is not too much room from the project entrance to that of the massage school.

- **Close Public Hearing:** Vice Chair deBlanc closed the Public Hearing.

- 1. CONSIDERATION AND POSSIBLE ACTION:** Discussion/possible action regarding a Conditional Use Permit Application for a RV Park with a maximum of 70 spaces and supporting infrastructure, including a pool, locker rooms, office, shop and the placement of a mobile home to house the applicant on site. Assessor's parcel number is 400-07-005. Address: 551 S. Broadway. The subject property is approximately 9.75 acres and is zoned commercial.

- Commissioner Olguin asked the applicant what approach was planned for managing the fragile ravine. Mr. Biasini indicated their intent was that nobody gets to go into the ravine. The applicant will explore a variety of options including a fence on the east and northeast sides of the property. Commissioner Olguin wanted to protect the ravine environment as a stipulation of approval.
- Commissioner Backus inquired about the size of the pool and whether it was about 20' x 40'. Mr. Biasini indicated the applicant is flexible on the size of the pool for as long as it is large enough to accommodate park visitors.
- Commissioner Backus also expressed concern about the look of the modular home and the vegetation. In addition, the size of the trees to be planted was called into question by Vice Chair deBlanc. Director Filardo indicated these items will be discussed during the Design Review Board session should the CUP move forward.
- Vice Chair deBlanc also questioned the lighting plan. Mr. Biasini indicated there will be footpath lighting and building lighting directed downward and fully shielded.
- Vice Chair deBlanc was interested in further restricting the quiet time. Commissioner Backus suggested a possible time difference during the summer months. Mr. Biasini contemplated an approach to different hours during the weekday versus the weekend. Commissioner Erickson as a former ranger at Rocky Mountain National Park with over 200 sites indicated there quiet hours began at 10 PM and there were no problems with that time at that location.
- Commissioner Backus recommended the use of low water use plants. Director Filardo shared that the project will adhere to the approved Clarkdale Plant List. Commissioner Backus suggested a reduced pool size such as 15' x 20'. Further, he recommended a non-reflective, non-white roofing material for the permanent structures to improve the view for the homeowners on the neighboring hillsides.

ACTION: Commissioner Olguin motioned to recommend approval of the conditional use permit application for the Rain Spirit RV Park based on staff's opinion of the compliance of the application with the elements of Applicable Regulations, Bulk Regulations, Performance, Traffic Impacts, Landscaping, and Nuisance and including the following conditions:

1. A building permit shall be issued prior to construction of the buildings included in the proposal.
2. Prior to issuance of a building permit, applicant will record deeds and restrictions for this project which include prohibition against tents and camping, additions of canopies or shade structures to RV units, limiting length of stay and restricting noise after 10:00 p.m.

3. Prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy, signage restricting RV exiting out of the park to right-turn only shall be installed.
4. All lighting shall be fully shielded and meet the requirements of Section Eight of the Zoning Code.
5. The applicant shall incorporate a rainwater harvesting plan and a greywater use plan into the final landscape plan.
6. The 4-inch fire hydrant shall be installed as shown on the site plan dated 7-31-15 prior to the issuance of a certificate of occupancy, and with the following additional stipulations:
 7. The applicant shall protect the facility of the ravine.
 8. The pool size shall be limited to 15' x 30'.

Commissioner Backus seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

7. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:

- a. Focus area plan community meeting

8. ADJOURNMENT: Vice Chairperson deBlanc entertained a motion for adjournment. Commissioner Backus motioned to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Erickson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

APPROVED BY:

SUBMITTED BY:



Ida de Blanc
Vice -Chairperson



Jodie Filardo
Director Community Development